EFQM Excellence Model as an External Assessment Tool in Higher Education

İlknur Kılıç

[1] *(Vocational School / Çankırı Karatekin University,TURKEY)*
Corresponding Author: İlknur Kılıç

Abstract : The aim of this research includes the comparison between quality management practices in higher education institutions and EFQM Excellence Model according to academic evaluation and quality improvement model in higher education institutions in law of HEC(YÖK).For that regard, a questionnaire has been developed based on the EFQM criteria and applied to the academic and administrative staffs at a state university. Total of 81 questionnaires was been received, analyzed in SPSS statistical analysis environment and results are tabulated and interpreted.According to the data obtained following the research, within the frame of 9 criteria of EFQM Excellence Model, strong and inadequate sides of existing quality practices in faculties have been defined. In the findings, it has been seen that there is not a statistically meaningful difference with regard to gender, occupation and age.In the light of such findings, proposals have been brought forward about EFQM Excellence Model's applicability as means of External Evaluation Process within the context of Academic Evaluation and Quality Improvement Regulation in Higher Education Institutions.

I.   INTRODUCTION

The topic of the study includes the comparison and evaluation between EFQM Excellence Model and quality standards envisaged in strategic planning studies applied in Higher Education Institutions in Turkey. The problem of research is; Is there a meaningful relationship between the European Quality Management Foundation (EFQM) Excellence Model and the Academic Evaluation and Quality Improvement Model in the Higher Education Act in Turkey? The main purpose of the regulation of academic evaluation and quality development in institutions of higher education enacted in 2005, is organize the guidelines for the evaluation of the education, teaching and research activities and administrative services of higher education institutions, the development of qualifications, the approval and recognition of quality levels through independent "external evaluation".

According to Turkish Quality Association's definition, the EFQM Quality Excellence Model is a framework that recognizes and continuous excellence can be achieved using many different approaches, and does not offer a prescription. The main purpose of the study is to compare quality improvement practices in higher education institutions with the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) Excellence Model, according to the Academic Evaluation and Quality Improvement Model of the Higher Education Act.

The EFQM Excellence Model is a quality model that constantly updates itself by gathering inputs on best practices which is tested in Europe and outside Europe. This research is important because the comparison between our academic evaluation and quality improvement model and the EFQM excellence model is investigating the appropriateness of the EFQM model as an external evaluation tool in our higher education institutions.

II.   CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

There are many definitions of quality concept in the literature. It is very difficult to make a common definition. Generally defined as usability, excellence. "Quality; Can be defined as the way in which all work in an enterprise is carried out efficiently, and the work of fulfilling and even exceeding the expectations of the customers ". (Rossiter, 1998). The quality is suitability to the customer or the user, conformity to the conditions; all the characteristics that indicate the ability of a product or service to meet a specific requirement are the degree of conformity with the wishes of the customer or the consumer. (Boone, Kurtz, 1996).

Different definitions have been made about Total Quality Management.The common definition of Total Quality Management is a contemporary management thought. It is a management approach aimed at

constantly raising the quality of the services offered and based on corporate engagement. "Total Quality Management is a management approach to maximizing productivity at a business, approaching zero defects and ensuring 100% customer satisfaction, and full internal participation" (Kalder, 2002). On the basis of TQM, in contrast to the classical management approach of change to the customer (internal and external customer) oriented, team spirit, continuous improvement and the understanding of education is rooted in. Take responsibility in improving the quality of everyone. Everyone in the future (vision), goals and what their contribution should be (and the mission) knows.

Organizations

• Increased competitive pressure

• Changing customer perceptions

• Hidden methods in the applied waste,

• The changing perceptions of individuals and managers,

•People and uncovering existing potential

•They change the business for the continuation of the existence of Total Quality Management (Köymen, 1999).

The structure of educational organizations has important roles in the creation of a democratic society. Because democratic society in order to sustain a healthy way of life is a great substitute for continuous development and improvement. Innovations not remaining insensitive to the cultural development of democratic life in closed societies can facilitate the continuation is impossible. For this reason, training organizations, continuous improvement, participation of all parties should have a management approach that is aimed at the production and quality of service. This can only be achieved by moving TQM applications to educational organizations. (Özveren, 1997).

According to Koksal (1998), the benefits of quality management practices in educational institutions can be listed as follows:

a) The Manager under the leadership of continuous improvement and development of the system,

b) Ensure the necessary coordination between parts of the system, the formation of a more harmonious and productive work order,

c) Everyone's participation in the educational process, ensuring

d) Increase the satisfaction of groups who have expectations from education

e) Teaching is teacher-centered as opposed to student-centered, becomes,

f) The information to be acquired is not the foreground application removal,

 g) Be given as long as evaluation does not result in,

h) Better visibility and meet the requirements of the future,

 i) The people in the system becomes open to change and innovation.

European countries' efforts to establish an effective Common European Higher Education Area (AEA) and European Research Area (AAA) have been shaped by the Bologna process and supported by the following processes (Yödek Rehberi, 2007).

Quality and standards in higher education in our country in order to achieve international harmonization in this area and the establishment of the Board of higher education by "the regulation of academic evaluation and quality development in higher education institutions" published(Yödek Guide, 2007). Institutions of higher education academic evaluation and quality improvement Commission was established to coordinate the work within the scope of this Regulation.

Each year institutions of higher education, "self-assessment" and "environmental assessment analysis" covering "institutional evaluation" a comprehensive and systematic review of its corporate activities and results activities(Yödek Guide, 2007). Regulation 16. According to the article, an institution of higher education deems appropriate, in that case, your own assessment processes, Registration, quality assessment document of an independent institution, organization, or in conjunction with the board can execute. For a healthy and active enterprise internal control, internal audit and external audit processes needs to be conducted in cooperation and harmony with each other. Healthy and an effective internal control system with management by creating an effective and efficient operation can be achieved. External audit, which is an entity designated or authorized personnel of customer in the case of food by an outside Agency and/or service that performs in business will receive in quality control. Thanks to the external controls of the system, the defects are detected early and corrective measures are taken without delay. Therefore, external controls are of great importance. EFQM (European Foundation for Quality Management Quality Award, the European quality Association, with the support of the European Commission and the European Foundation for quality management since 1991, and are in force. They are progressing on the path of excellence the EFQM excellence model organisations in developing their management systems by measuring is a practical tool that helps them; it motivates by making them see the strengths and development areas of the organization to develop solutions (Kalder, 2003).

The model consists of 9 main and 32 sub criteria. It brings a holistic perspective to the organization. Flexible and unfolding structure is the upper part of the model. These 9 main criteria constituting the model

represent a strong causal relation. 5 of these criteria constitute the "input" criteria and 4 of them constitute the "conclusion" criteria. The activities that the establishment makes are "Input", and the "Results" resulting from them indicate that they are realized by the foundation (http://kalder.org).

III.   RESEARCH METHOD

This section includes the research model, the researcher's universe and sample, the collection of data, and the analysis and interpretation of data.

The aim of the research is to compare the quality evaluation standards of the EFQM Excellence Model with the academic evaluation and quality improvement model in higher education institutions and to evaluate the existing quality concept according to the criteria of Excellence Model. According to this purpose, research is descriptive. Description research attempts to understand and describe situations, events, persons, groups. The suitability of the study of descriptive research for reason of research is appropriate in terms of analysis and interpretation in terms of time and cost. Data were collected by questionnaire survey.

The research was carried out at Gazi University, a state university in Ankara. Random sample selection was made with selected teaching staff and 81 staff members approved by the administrative staff to answer the questionnaire. In the thesis research, previously prepared domestic and foreign sources related to the subject were benefited from library, internet environment, published articles and books. Survey questions have been prepared within the framework of the EFQM Excellence Model criteria and the sub criteria of these criteria, taking advantage of the research done in the past years and expert opinion. The data obtained from the questionnaire forms were analyzed using SPSS 17.0 package program in computer environment.

The research questions developed for general purpose are as follows.

Are the EFQM Excellence Model criteria related to quality practices in higher education institutions related to each other?

Are leadership behaviors and strategies and planning work in higher education institutions related to each other in the framework of EFQM excellence model criteria?

Within the framework of the EFQM excellence model criteria, are the strategies and planning work of higher education institutions and the management of the institution's human resources related to each other?

Are the practices related to the management of processes in higher education institutions within the framework of the EFQM excellence model criteria and the practices related to the management of collaborations and resources related to each other?

Are the processes of managing processes in higher education institutions within the framework of the EFQM excellence model criteria and the human resources management practices related to each other?

Are the perceptions and satisfaction results of employees related to the management of processes in higher education institutions within the framework of the EFQM excellence model criteria and the results of their connections with each other?

IV.   RESULTS

This section includes the findings and interpretations obtained as a result of the analysis of the data obtained from the questionnaires.

Table 1. Demographic Findings of Survey Participants

Variables		N	%
Gender	Female	27	33,3
	Male	54	66,7
Age	26-35	32	39,5
	36-45	28	34,6
	46-...	21	25,9

The distribution of the participants in the survey according to gender is presented in Table 1. According to this result, 33.3% of the participants are female and 66.7% are male. According to this, it appears that the majority of the participants participating in the survey are men.

Results Relating to Descriptive Statistics:

According to findings related to the EFQM Excellence Model criteria Leadership criterion; "Faculty leaders are sufficient to create the mission and vision of the faculty." Approximately 34% of participants did not participate in the questionnaire, while 28% were undecided. As can be understood from this statement, it can be said that the faculty leaders are not enough to form the mission and vision of the faculty. At a rate of about 51%, participants indicated that leaders were effective in their recovery and development work, but close to 50% were undecided or uninvolved in this regard.

According to the statements given to the questions within the scope of the strategy and planning criterion of the model criteria; The development of the services of the faculty has been observed to pay attention to the social, legal and environmental issues related to the field of services. Approximately 46% of the participants in the item indicated "Participate", and about 8% indicated the Participate strictly. It can be said that there is no policy and strategy defined in the faculties. At the same time, it is observed that 53% of the participants were unstable in the fact that plans and strategies were updated in comparison with targets and actual values.

According to the statements made to the employees' critical questions, the majority of the respondents who think that satisfaction measures are being carried out within the human resources plan and strategies within the context are the majority with 61%. In this case, satisfaction of faculty employees is measured. Approximately 83% of the participants are encouraged to participate in the faculty by organizing conferences and ceremonies. However, while the majority of respondents who think that the management of hiring and recruitment processes are not based on equality of opportunity, fairness and honesty constitute the majority with 57%, about 19% are unstable in this respect.

According to the responses to the questions on collaborations and resources, the following conclusions emerged: "The presence of the faculty (buildings, equipment and materials) is in keeping with the needs of the users, in a timely and accurate manner." More than 50% of the participants are involved. It is seen that approximately 60% of the participants are participating in the expression "Information is provided at the required time in and out of the faculty" which explains the sub-criteria of managing information and knowledge.

According to the statements given to the processes criterion, it can be said that about 67% of the participants think that there is no process management system of the majority. There is a lack of research in the field of research on the provision of contributions to the design and management of processes and of cooperating organizations. EFQM Excellence In the process of designing, designing and implementing the processes in the criteria of the Processes of the Excellence Model, it is worked with the employees and the cooperating organizations and these individuals and organizations are informed about the changes. According to the results of the research, it is seen that there are deficiencies about the determination of the responsible persons in the management of the business processes.

According to the findings related to customers' results, It is observed that customer satisfaction surveys have been implemented in order to measure student satisfaction in faculty and faculty involvement in faculties. Approximately 70% of participants participate in the subject matter. However, it is observed that the participants did not consider the indicators and values to be used in interpretation. In this case it is concluded that the (student) satisfaction measurements are made but there are deficiencies in interpreting these measurements. While 52% of the suggestions, complaints and objections are collected and answered in the faculty, 18% are undecided. In this case, the suggestions and complaints should be collected and answered deficiencies are observed.

According to the findings about the results of the employees, it is seen that 53% of the respondents answered that they do not agree with the questionnaire about consistency of the targeted staff satisfaction and satisfaction measurements, and 32% answered that they do not participate and definitely do not participate. 15% of the respondents agree that I agree and I strongly agree. Accordingly, it is observed that there is a lack of consistency in the satisfaction of the target staff and satisfaction measurements.

According to the statements about community outcomes and key performance outcomes, 70% of the participants stated that the faculty contributed to community services (education and training activities, health support, voluntary work and charity work, etc.). However, the perceptions of the society related to the faculty, such as questionnaires, reports, open meetings to the public, It is seen that 44% of the participants answered that they do not agree and strongly disagree. It has been observed that participants often use the "undecided" expression of about 47% in their perception that the perceived image of the community is improving day by day. The rate of those who do not participate in this item is about 20%. Accordingly, it can be concluded that the percentage of respondents who responded that the perceived image of the community is perceived as being increasing day by day is low, and that the faculty members do not have knowledge of the faculty image of the faculty in the eyes of the community or the faculty image is not improving.

Relevant results between the model's criteria

Table 2 Relations Between Model Criteria

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Leadership	1							
Strategy and Planning	,707**	1						

Employees	,543[**]	,715[**]	1					
Collaborations and Resources	,476[**]	,555[**]	,621[**]	1				
Processes	,596[**]	,688[**]	,709[**]	,776[**]	1			
Results for Clients	,566[**]	,638[**]	,662[**]	,583[**]	,650[**]	1		
Employees Results	,483[**]	,567[**]	,475[**]	,677[**]	,753[**]	,619[**]	1	
Community Related Results	,627[**]	,656[**]	,643[**]	,563[**]	,696[**]	,593[**]	,599[**]	1

According to Table 2, there is a high positive and significant relationship between the criteria. P <.01Findings, there is a high positive correlation between the leadership criterion and the Strategy and Planning criterion, r = .707, p <.01. Accordingly, the result is that the leaders of the organization are highly related to strategy and planning efforts, and that they have an important role in the preparation and effective implementation of the strategy, plan and policies of the organization.

There is a high positive correlation between the employees' criterion and the Strategy and Planning criterion, r = .715, p <.01. It is supported by the results of the end-of-study that the relationship between the needs and expectations of employees and the policies and strategies of the organization, the dissemination of policies and strategies to employees, the organization's policies and strategies, and the harmonization of human resource practices and human resources policies and strategies .

There is a high positive correlation between Strategy and Planning criterion and Process criterion, r = .688, p <.01. Accordingly, the definition and design of the Processes that are in accordance with the organization's policy strategies, the definition of the Processes in line with the mission and vision of the organization, the relationship between the strategy and the planning criterion and the process criterion in terms of establishing policies and strategies within this structure are in line with the research results.

There is a high positive correlation between the Employees and Process criteria, r = .709, p <.01. According to the findings of this study, it is found that there is a relationship between the employees' criteria and the process criterion in terms of giving employees' ideas in the stages of defining, designing and renewing the processes, ensuring the employees' participation in these steps, informing and empowering the employees who will apply the new processes, It was confirmed.

There is a high positive correlation between the Processes Criteria and the Collaborations and Resources Criteria, r = .776, p <.01. According to these two criteria, it is necessary to work with the cooperating institutions and organizations as well as employees in the identification and design of the processes, to provide information to the cooperating institutions when new processes are developed and in process changes. New technologies are identified and replaced with old ones to be included in the processes, the development of new processes through the developments in the resources of the foundation, and the updating of the old processes are supported by the results of research.

There is a high positive correlation between the criterion of processes and the outcome criterion of employees, r = .753, p <.01. Within the scope of results related to employees, organizations measure employees' skills development, performance evaluations, satisfaction, perceptions about the establishment and use it as a tool to participate in the processes of establishment. Participation in the design and development of processes, involvement in quality work, motivation of employees in business processes, number of suggestions and recommendations for each process, and so on. Performance evaluations and satisfaction measurements are made. Research findings support the conclusion that these two criteria are related.

In the questionnaires, the participants assessed the current quality understanding in the higher education institution they were affiliated to according to the EFQM Excellence Model criteria. EFQM Excellence According to the results of the correlation analysis of scores of each of the criteria of each model, each criterion is related to each other.

It is suggested that faculty leaders should devote more time and resources to the work of building the mission and vision of the faculty first, and they should be more careful about this issue. According to the EFQM Excellence Model, the policy and strategy of the institution and the organization should be defined and designed, and this policy and strategy should be spread to the employees, the institutions and organizations that are cooperated, and the beneficiaries. However, it has been observed that the vast majority of employees in higher education institutions involved in research do not have knowledge about policies and strategies. The mission and vision of the organization can be reached through the definition of politics and strategies and the passing of the past. For this, the application of the EFQM Excellence Model in higher education institutions and

the identification and dissemination of the policies and strategies of the higher education institution and the fulfillment of the aims and objectives of the institution will be beneficial in raising the quality standards.

Excellent organizations according to the EFQM Excellence Model "Employees" criteria manage, enhance and freely use their knowledge and all their potentials at the individual level, at the team level and throughout the organization. At the same time, in order to provide employee satisfaction according to the model, appraisal and rewarding policies are determined and implemented in accordance with fair and equal opportunities. The vast majority of respondents indicated that they were not treated fairly and honestly during recruitment and career development. In addition, the satisfaction level of the staff and the satisfaction level of the employees are not consistent. From these angles, it is considered that the model will increase the satisfaction of the personnel targeted to be implemented in the higher education institution. Employees in higher education institutions are especially important for the institution of academic staff. Satisfaction of this staff affects its commitment to the institution, its perception about the institution. According to the model's employee outcomes criteria, excellent organizations use comprehensive performance and perception indicators for their employees and achieve successful results.

According to the excellence model "cooperations and resources" criterion, financial resources should be inspected and transparency must be ensured. According to the research results, financial figures are not clear and transparent. The implementation of the model of excellence is thought to contribute to ensuring transparency in the management of financial resources. According to the EFQM Excellence Model "Processes" criteria, it is necessary to identify and design processes that are in line with the policies and strategies of the faculty, and those processes should be communicated to all employees, beneficiaries, and cooperating organizations. However, the results of the research show that the vast majority of faculty members are unaware that they have processes that are in line with the policies and strategies of the faculty. Accordingly, it is necessary to make informed studies about the processes. According to the "Results for customers" criterion, excellent organizations use comprehensive performance and perception indicators for their clients and achieve successful results. According to the results of the research, it is revealed that customer (student) satisfaction measurements are made but the indicators and values used in interpretation are not found. By applying EFQM Excellence Model to the institution, successful results can be achieved by using comprehensive indicator values.

In conclusion, EFQM Excellence Model can be applied in higher education institutions, implementation of model will contribute to quality improvement studies, determination of mission and vision of higher education institutions will enable identification of policies and strategies in reaching this and that employees will be able to benefit from all their knowledge by providing satisfaction, It can be said that the beneficiaries will develop the image of higher education institutions in the eyes of the students and the society.

REFERENCES

[1] J. Rossiter, Total quality management: mastering your small business (CIB Publishing,1998).
[2] L.E. Boone, D.L Kurtz, Contemporary business. (Orlando: The Dryden Press,1996).
[3] Kalder. Eğitim Kurumları için Toplam Kalite Yönetimi ve Öz değerlendirme (İstanbul: Kalder Yayınları, 2002).
[4] E. Köymen, Bir haftada toplam kalite yönetimini anlama (İstanbul: Dünya Yayınları,1999).
[5] M. Özveren, Toplam Kalite Yönetiminde Temel Kavramlar ve Uygulamalar,(İstanbul:Alfa Yayınları,1997).
[6] H. Köksal, Kalite Okullarına Geçişte Toplam Kalite Yönetimi (İstanbul: Dünya Yayınları, 1998).
[7] Yödek Rehberi 2007 (http://www.yodek.org.tr/yodek/files/7aa12f8d2582deb44d4249c7aa4a2020.pdf) Erişim: 10.02.2017
[8] Kal Der, EFQM mükemmellik modeli 2003: Kamu ve sivil toplum (İstanbul:Kal Der., 2003).
[9] (http://kalder.org/kalderhakkinda.aspx?id=18) Erişim: 10.02.2017